

Appendix A – Meeting Agenda

Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee Meeting # 49

February 15, 2023
6:30 p.m. – 8:30 p.m.

Hybrid Meeting

In-Person: Waterfront Neighbourhood Centre
627 Queens Quay West
Toronto, ON
M5V 3G3

Online: Zoom

<https://lura-ca.zoom.us/j/68025292046?pwd=dW5xY21Pd2tyVUUtWK2NVeldsUjRDQT09>
Meeting ID: 680 2529 2046
Passcode: Porter

AGENDA

- 6:30** Log-In & Welcome (LURA)
- 6:35** Review of Meeting Minutes and Action Items (LURA)
- 6:40** Welcoming New Members/Introductions (LURA)
- 7:00** Overview of the Revised Terms of Reference and CLC Mandate (LURA)
- 7:30** Update from the CEO (RJ Steenstra)
- 7:45** CLC Member Updates (YQNA/BQNA/TICA/EWCA)
- 8:10** Air Quality Study Update (Angela Homewood/Joan Prowse)
- 8:25** Business Arising
- 8:30** Adjourn

Materials Sent in Advance

- DRAFT Revised CLC Terms of Reference – for review and discussion at the meeting

**Appendix B – Revised Terms of Reference and CLC Mandate
Presentation**

Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport
Community Liaison Committee
Terms of Reference Refresh
February 15, 2023



PORTS
TORONTO

An aerial photograph of Toronto, Canada, taken from an elevated position looking down at the city and the airport. The skyline is visible in the background with the CN Tower as a prominent feature. The water of Lake Ontario is in the foreground, and the airport's runways and taxiways are visible on the right side. The sky is a mix of dark blue and purple, suggesting dusk or dawn. The text "CLC REFRESH" is overlaid in the center in a white, sans-serif font.

CLC REFRESH

CLC Context and History

- The PortsToronto, Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee (CLC) - operating since February 2011.
- A new Liaison Strategy is being proposed to:
 - Update the TOR with community input
 - Fill long-standing vacant positions
 - Invite new voices from existing representative organizations
 - Broaden stakeholder representation to align with Toronto's growing waterfront
 - Advance diversity and inclusion within the CLC.
- Interviews conducted in Summer 2022 with 19 representatives of 9 organizations.
- Presentations at CLC 47 (Sept 2022) and CLC 48 (Nov 2022)

Item 1 - Update Terms of Reference with Community Input

- Input gathered through CLC member interviews in Summer 2022 was used to draft revisions to the ToR to reflect:
 - Clarification of PortsToronto's jurisdiction and the CLC mandate
 - Broadening the CLC membership
 - Updating terms of membership
 - Role of the facilitator in advancing constructive discussion
- Draft revisions shared in advance of this meeting, and **open for input until March 31st, 2023.**
- Revised copy of the TOR with CLC member input will be reshared in mid-April 2023
- Seek to confirm the CLC TOR at CLC #50 on May 17, 2023.

Item 2 - Fill Vacant Positions

Item 3 - Invite new voices from existing representative organizations

Organization	New Rep(s)
City of Toronto Waterfront Secretariat	Jay Paleja
Toronto District School Board	<i>Declined to participate</i>
Spadina-Fort York (Municipal) Office of Councillor Ausma Malik	Bushra Mir
Spadina-Fort York (Federal) Office of MP Kevin Vuong	Daiana Ferrari
Air Canada	Joanna Dobson
Nieuport	Jennifer Quinn & Cheryl Stone
NAV Canada	Indren Nair

Item 2 - Fill Vacant Positions

Item 3 - Invite new voices from existing representative organizations

Organization	Positions Outstanding
Waterfront Toronto	Sarah Chapin <i>(Interim Representative)</i>
Waterfront Hotel	<i>To be identified</i>
Arts, Culture, and Tourism sector rep	<i>To be identified</i>
Yacht Club in the Inner Harbour	<i>To be identified</i>

Item 4 - Broaden stakeholder representation to align with Toronto's growing waterfront

Organization	New Rep(s)
East Waterfront Neighbourhood Association	David Chan Cathy Nguyen
Business - Art & Water (formerly Pirate Life)	Matt Slaman
HMCS York	Commander Paul Smith
Toronto Police Service	<i>TBC</i>
Waterfront Neighbourhood Centre	Natasha Francis
University of Toronto – Municipal Affairs	Mark Maloney

Item 5 - Advance diversity and inclusion within the CLC

- CLC members now includes additional waterfront stakeholders, not present or not considered during the 2015 TOR refresh
- Self-identified diversity of background of CLC members was not asked or assessed as most representatives are self-selected from organizations with membership on the CLC

An aerial photograph of Toronto, Canada, featuring the city skyline with the CN Tower, Lake Ontario, and the Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport. The image is overlaid with a dark blue gradient and a white border with rounded corners.

REVISED TERMS OF REFERENCE OVERVIEW

CLC Mandate Overview

- Engage in two-way dialogue with PortsToronto regarding ongoing operations
- CLC is a non-statutory forum for dialogue
- PortsToronto is required to operate within the context of the 1983 Tripartite Agreement, including the parameters established by this agreement
 - PortsToronto does not have the authority to change parameters unilaterally
 - Parameters of the agreement include regulatory requirements set by external bodies, e.g. Transport Canada, that PortsToronto must comply with

CLC Mandate Overview

- The CLC acts in an advisory capacity to PortsToronto's Senior Leadership Team in the spirit of collaboration oriented towards ongoing development, growth, operations, and activities of the airport such as:
 - Airport operations and plans that may affect health, safety, community and economic conditions in the surrounding area;
 - Noise management; and
 - City building and environmental sustainability initiatives.
- It is NOT a venue for:
 - Airing personal or individual grievances.
 - Making decisions about the current or future operations of the airport.

CLC Membership Overview

- **PortsToronto** – Designates of the CEO
- **Terminal Operator** – Nieuport Aviation
- **Commercial Operators** - Porter Airlines, Air Canada, and eventually Connect Airlines
- **Federal Government** – Office of MP for Spadina-Fort York
- **City of Toronto** - Office of Councillor for Spadina-Fort York & Waterfront Secretariat
- **Local Residents** - YQNA, BQNA, TICA, and EWCA
- **Business** – TRBOT, Waterfront BIA, Waterfront Hotel, and 1 waterfront business
- **Institutions** – HMCS York, TPS, University of Toronto
- **Community Services** - Arts, Culture, and Tourism sector rep, Ireland Park, WNC, Yacht Club rep

Additional resource representatives as required

CLC Membership Overview

- Alternates may be nominated as required but must have similar expertise and experience
- Recommended term is 2 years with option to be reappointed for 2 additional terms
- If absent for 3 consecutive meetings, will be contacted by facilitator to discuss participation
- Subcommittees to the CLC may be formed to discuss additional focused topics, comprised of members drawn from the CLC

Roles & Responsibilities Committee Members

- Solicit input and feedback from broader constituencies
- Provide advice, feedback, and perspectives on question, proposals, or other matters
- Report, without bias, committee discussions back to constituencies
- Attend meetings as required
- Review committee minutes to ensure accurate recording
- Reflect a solutions-oriented and fact-based approach that seeks to work constructively and collaboratively

Roles & Responsibilities

Billy Bishop Airport Management

- Provide accurate and understandable information
- Ensure appropriate staff or resource representatives with specific expertise are present on discussions of specific issues
- Listen to the advice and perspectives of members, and where feasible initiate action to address committee recommendations
- Provide relevant material to committee members for review in advance of meetings

Roles & Responsibilities Facilitator

- Identify purpose, objectives, and opportunities for input into agenda items
- Keep meetings on-time within the allocated time set in the agenda
- Seek a plurality of voices and opinions are heard throughout the meeting
- Remind committee members of previous conversations and topics that are beyond the scope of the committee's mandate

Operating Procedure

- 4 meetings per year
- Meeting may be held in-person, online, or a simultaneous hybrid format
- Agenda to be developed by the facilitator in consultation with the Chairperson and committee members
- Consensus-based approach while recognizing differing perspectives and noting these
- Agendas and supporting material circulated at least 1 week in advance
 - Major reports (e.g. Annual Sustainability Report) circulated 1 month in advance
- Must declare conflict of interest, if present
- Accurately reporting proceedings without bias or preference
- No stipends

Next Steps

- Additional written feedback on the TOR accepted until March 31, 2023
- Revised TOR with member comments will be circulated mid-April 2023
- Seeking to confirm the TOR by CLC #50 on May 17, 2023
- LURA will continue to reach out to four vacant positions to recruit representatives
 - Recommendations or specific contacts welcome



Questions Comments



Appendix C – Revised Terms of Reference Draft



PortsToronto

Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport

Community Liaison Committee

Terms of Reference

Approved October 19, 2010

As Amended: June 13, 2012

As Amended: May 15, 2015

As Amended: WHEN FINALIZED IN MAY 2023

1. ROLE

The PortsToronto, Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport (Billy Bishop Airport) Community Liaison Committee (the committee) will provide a forum for a wide range of Billy Bishop Airport stakeholders (defined in Section 3) and nearby residents to engage in a two-way dialogue with PortsToronto staff regarding ongoing operations of the airport. Each party will have the opportunity to communicate their perspectives and observations to airport management. Further, it will enable airport management to communicate proposals, planning issues and other relevant activities and information to stakeholders and the broader community.

PortsToronto's Jurisdiction

PortsToronto established the committee (formerly known as the CLC) in 2010 as a non-statutory forum for dialogue with airport stakeholders to share information and receive feedback on the airport's operations and growth plans in downtown Toronto. As a signatory of the 1983 Tripartite Agreement with the City of Toronto and the Federal Government, PortsToronto bears responsibility for the management and operation of the airport. PortsToronto and Billy Bishop Airport are required to comply with regulatory requirements per the Tripartite Agreement.

2. MANDATE

The committee will be an advisory body to the Billy Bishop Airport ~~Director~~Senior Management Team, providing an opportunity to ask questions and work in the spirit of collaboration comments, feedback and suggestions oriented towards the on airport's ongoing development, growth, operations and activityies, including:

- Airport operations and plans that may affect health, safety, community and economic conditions in the surrounding area;
- Noise ~~relating to aircraft and airport operations~~management; and
- City building and environmental sustainability initiatives.

The committee is NOT a venue focused on:

- Airing personal or individual grievances.
- Making decisions about the current or future operations of the airport.

3. COMPOSITION

3.1 Membership

The committee will be comprised of members who are generally representative of the waterfront community, including persons representing the interests of waterfront residents, businesses, consumers, the travelling public and aviation industry representatives.

Committee members are guided by these Terms of Reference and participate on the committee at the discretion of Billy Bishop Airport.

The committee will consist of a Chairperson and ~~nineteen~~ up to twenty-seven (1927) ~~volunteer standing~~ members:

3.1.1 Membership Format

- -Chairperson – PortsToronto - Billy Bishop Airport ~~Executive Vice President~~ Designate of the CEO of PortsToronto or designate. -The Chairperson will be supported by PortsToronto staff ranging in expertise and roles encompassing communications and public affairs; infrastructure, planning, and environment; and airport operations and security ~~the Vice President Public Affairs, and the Vice President of Infrastructure, Planning and Environment whom~~ who will attend all committee meetings.

- ~~Three-Four (43)~~ local residents — ~~Three (3)~~ are to be appointed including one from each of the relevant neighbourhood associations – Bathurst Quay ~~Residents’~~ Neighbourhood Association, York Quay ~~Residents’~~ Neighbourhood Association, ~~and~~ Toronto Island ~~Residents’~~ Community Association, ~~and~~ East Waterfront Community Association. ~~An independent recruiter will work with the above-mentioned~~ Recommended representatives of these community groups will be confirmed; using the attached criteria, to select appropriate members. ~~One (1) local resident at large will be selected through a PortsToronto selection process, based on the attached CLC member selection criteria.~~
- ~~Two-Three (23)~~ business representatives – One (1) to be identified by the Toronto Board of Trade, ~~and~~ one (1) by the Waterfront BIA, ~~and (1) by a~~ waterfront business. In ~~both-all~~ cases these representatives must not be directly associated with Billy Bishop Airport operations or capital projects.
- One (1) City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat representative.
- ~~One (1) representative from Tourism Toronto – to be identified by the Board of Directors of Tourism Toronto.~~
- One (1) representative from Waterfront Toronto – to be identified by the ~~CEO of~~ VP of Communications and Engagement from Waterfront Toronto, or their designate.
- ~~Two-One (21)~~ Councillors or designate, representing ~~Wards 20 and 28~~ Ward 10 Spadina-Fort York.
- One (1) Member of Parliament or designate, representing the Spadina-Fort York riding
- ~~One (1) Representative from the Council of Commodores.~~
- One (1) Representative from a Toronto Waterfront Hotel.
- One (1) Representative from the City of Toronto (PFR) Waterfront Neighbourhood Centre.
- One (1) representative from the Arts, Culture, and Tourism sector
- One (1) Waterfront park trustee, representing Ireland Park.
- One (1) Representative from the Toronto District School Board (TDSB).
- One (1) Representative of a Yacht Club operating in the Toronto Harbour area.
- One (1) Representative of the HMCS York
- One (1) Representative of the Toronto Police Service (TPS)
- One (1) Representative per waterfront higher educational institution

3.1.12. Alternates

If necessary, members may nominate an alternate from their organization to attend committee meetings in their place, provide that such alternates have similar expertise and experience as the members.

3.1.3 Additional Recruitment

Recruitment of stakeholders will be conducted by LURA Consulting (the Facilitator), PortsToronto's independent facilitator and notetaker for the CLC, and will take place in accordance with the members listed in Section 3.1

3.2 Term

Members will serve a two (2) year term, but may be reappointed for two additional terms. Members are encouraged, where possible, to respect these term limits and to reappoint a new representative when their term has expired. Reappointment recommendations will be made by the selecting organization in writing to PortsToronto.

If a member is absent for three consecutive meetings, that member will be contacted to discuss their participation on the committee, and asked to withdraw if the absences continue.

Members will notify the Chairperson and the facilitator if they wish to withdraw from the committee for any reason. Vacant positions will be filled as soon as possible.

3.3 Resource Representatives

Resource representatives will be available to the committee on an as required or ad hoc basis, as determined by the committee. Resource representatives will be invited by the Chairperson to attend specific committee meetings where their experience or expertise will be of interest or add value to the committee's deliberations.

Resource representatives are expected to include:

- Transport Canada regional staff representatives;
- NAV Canada staff representatives;
- Air Transport Association of Canada representatives;
- Billy Bishop Airport and PortsToronto staff;
- Toronto Public Health;
- Air Quality Analysts-and
- Other City of Toronto staff.

From time to time, the committee may request the attendance of other relevant representatives from other Billy Bishop Airport stakeholders to attend committee or subcommittee meetings for the purposes of receiving information or seeking staff input and recommendations.

3.4 Subcommittees

Standing subcommittees may be formed, as required, to manage the following:

- Noise management, transportation and environmental sustainability; and
- Planning and infrastructure.

Subcommittee members will be drawn from the overall committee. To the extent possible, the composition of each subcommittee will mirror that of the overall committee (i.e. mix of resident, business, and client representatives).

4 ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES

4.1 Committee Members

Committee members will:

- Be responsible for soliciting input and feedback from the broader constituencies and committees they represent, and for sharing this with the committee;
- Provide advice, feedback and perspectives on questions, proposals or other matters provided by Billy Bishop Airport management and PortsToronto for discussion;
- Report, without bias, committee discussions and outcomes back to their organizations, communities and constituencies;
- Attend committee and subcommittee meetings as required, and brief an alternate if necessary;
- Review the committee minutes to ensure that proceedings have been accurately recorded; and
- Reflect a solution-oriented and fact-based approach that seeks to work constructively and collaboratively [discuss practices and measures to mitigate local effects of airport operations with the goal of towards identifying and adopting measures that will make improving the airport's ability to act as a good neighbour and the neighbourhood better.](#)

~~4.1.2~~ Billy Bishop Airport Management

Billy Bishop Airport management commit to:

- Provide accurate, understandable information to committee members, such that members can contribute informed advice and recommendations;
- Help the committee function effectively by providing information, and offering suggestions and alternatives to address issues, concerns and problems being discussed;
- Ensure that the appropriate staff or resource representatives with specific expertise are present at discussions on specific issues or matters to assist the committee with information and technical needs;
- Listen carefully to [the](#) advice and perspectives of members and where feasible and appropriate, initiate action to address committee recommendations;
- Provide appropriate, relevant materials to committee members for review in advance of meetings; and
- [vi.](#) Provide secretarial support for the committee.

4.3 Facilitator

The Billy Bishop Airport CLC facilitator will endeavour to:

- i. Specifically identify the purpose, objectives, and opportunities for input into agenda items at each meeting to ensure they meet the intended mandate of the SLC TOR.
- ii. Keep meeting items on-time within the allocated time set in the agenda.
- iii. Seek a plurality of voices and opinions are heard throughout the meeting.
 - a. The facilitator will actively call upon individuals to ask if they have questions or comments on an item and keep the discussion moving along to welcome broad participation.
- iv. Remind participants of previous conversations and topics that are beyond the scope of the committee's mandate to avoid repetitive conversations.

~~vii.~~

5 OPERATING PROCEDURES

5.1 Committee Meetings

The committee will meet a minimum of four (4) times a year. -Subcommittees ~~will~~may meet more frequently, as required. Meetings will be generally held in the evenings, with duration of no more than three (3) hours.

Meetings will be held at venues that are acceptable to the committee – ~~this may include in-person and online meetings (or simultaneous hybrid meetings)-~~ Meetings will be open to the public, at the discretion of the committee.

Meeting agendas will be developed by the ~~Chairperson~~facilitator, in consultation with the Chairperson and committee members.

5.2 Mode of Operation

A consensus-based approach – where members seek general agreement on issues and recommendations – will be the operating approach for the committee. If consensus is not achieved, differing perspectives and feedback will be reported in the committee minutes. Given this, the committee is not responsible for making decisions or passing motions regarding Billy Bishop Airport or its operations.

5.3 Meeting Management and Reporting

Meeting agendas and supporting materials will be circulated to members at least one (1) week in advance of meetings, to enable members to prepare fully and seek input or advice from their organizations or constituencies. Meeting minutes will be circulated to members within three (3) weeks of each meeting. Minutes are subject to email approval by members followed by approval confirmation at the following meeting. Final minutes will be posted on PortsToronto website.

5.4.1 Conflict of Interest

Members must declare a conflict of interest prior to becoming a member of the committee and/or prior to addressing specific matters where an actual or perceived conflict of interest may exist.

5.5 Communications and Media

Committee members will abide by the committee communications protocol. This includes accurately reporting on the discussions and topics held within the meeting without bias or preference.

PortsToronto will establish a section for the committee on its website to publish relevant documents (including meeting agendas and minutes) and to encourage feedback from non-committee members.

5.6 Funding

The annual operational costs of the committee will be paid for by PortsToronto.

No stipends or fees will be paid to members of the committee.

Recruitment and Appointment Process for Resident Representatives of the PortsToronto Billy Bishop Airport Community Liaison Committee

Guiding Principles

The following principles will be applied to recruiting, selecting and appointing the ~~three~~four (~~34~~) BBCTA Community Liaison Committee resident members:

Openness: The application process should be open to all waterfront and BBCTA area residents who live within the bounds of the three residents' associations represented on the committee.

Transparency: The application and selection process should be made clear to those who wish to apply.

Replicability: The application process should follow a similar process used by the City of Toronto for citizen appointment to civic advisory committees.

Recruitment

The opportunity to apply for one of the ~~three~~four (~~43~~) resident seats on the committee will be publicized through:

- Direct contact with the ~~three~~four local resident associations' (TICA, BQNA, YQNA, EWCA) executives
- Posting on the PortsToronto website
- Notices in relevant community association publications
- Liaison with local ~~Ward 20 and 28~~Spadina-Fort York City Councillors

Committee Operating Criteria for all members of the Billy Bishop Airport Community Liaison Committee

Membership on the committee will be open to those who:

- Are interested in working productively with the Billy Bishop Airport on two-way communications between the Billy Bishop Airport and its community
- Agree to solicit input and feedback from the broader communities they represent
- Can demonstrate effective participation in community, consensus-based discussions
- Can commit to meeting a minimum of 4 times a year (plus potential subcommittee meetings)
- Agree to participate on the committee in accordance with the Terms of Reference

Appendix D – BQNA Community Update Written Submission

Subject: lack of action on noise complaints – for discussion

We wish to raise the issue of noise reports to Ports Toronto and BBTCA and why nothing seems to happen to resolve these complaints. The feeling from many community members is that they keep sending in these reports with no remediations. People are frustrated and giving up sending in the reports.

Specifically:

- There are the highpitched noises of the A/C-Heating units that begin at 5:30 am as they are attached to the planes to get them prepared and run until 11 pm. Wakes everyone up and is really annoying. Continuous high-pitched noise.
- This and the next noise (low pitched idling of the planes) are not super loud but they are low frequency and continuous which makes the window frames in the building vibrate.
- Then the planes are pushed out on our side with the engine exhausts facing our building and then rev engines and idle to get the planes ready to go. Continuous low level noise.
- And when there are several planes in a row this all gets magnified!
- Then they finally get to the runway and take-off and land....another source of noise but now loud challenging noise as the engines gear up to go or reverse thrust to land.

Question to CLC is: when are you going to address the noise complaints and mediate it?

Here are some considerations on possible ways to reduce the airport noises, especially early morning.

The early morning noises that start around 5:30 are perceived as VERY loud as there is almost no other ambient noise at that time of day. So every noise is heard. Later in the day, regular traffic sounds somewhat muffle these sounds. The morning high-pitched sound can be particularly annoying as it is not intermittent. And the plane idling noise is enlarged especially as the planes on the East side are pushed out and angled facing south/west which means the exhaust noise is being forced to the north east side.

HVAC system and Plane Idling noises Resolution:

1. Have the 2-3 early morning planes dock on the south side of the airport (not the sides) for early morning take-offs. There are usually only 2-3 so this just mean changing the boarding location.
2. These planes will now warm-up and idle with their exhausts facing south where the trees block the sound. And the Airport Building will block the sound of both the HVAC and Idling from the residents on the north side.
3. Perhaps the planes on the east and west sides of the airport can then be warmed up later, after 7 for example instead of 5:30 am as they would take off later. It seems that this change of boarding location might be very helpful in at least reducing early morning noise.