



**PortsToronto**

**Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport**

**Community Liaison Committee**

**Meeting #49**

**Meeting Minutes**

February 15, 2023

Hybrid Meeting

In-Person: Waterfront Neighbourhood Centre  
Virtual: Zoom

**Toronto, Ontario**

Minutes prepared by:





These meeting minutes were prepared by LURA Consulting. LURA provides neutral third-party consultation services for the Ports Toronto Community Liaison Committee (CLC). These minutes are not intended to provide verbatim accounts of committee discussions. Rather, they summarize and document the key points made during the discussions, as well as the outcomes and actions arising from the committee meetings. If you have any questions or comments regarding the Meeting Minutes, please contact either:

**Michael Antle**

Director – Airport Security,  
Compliance and Planning

**PortsToronto**

[MAntle@portstoronto.com](mailto:MAntle@portstoronto.com)

OR

**Alexander Furneaux CLC**

Facilitator

**LURA Consulting**

Phone: 289-768-5561

[afurneaux@lura.ca](mailto:afurneaux@lura.ca)



## Summary of Action Items from Meeting #49

Action Item	Action Item Task	Who is Responsible for Action Item
M#49-A1	Finalize CLC Meeting #48 Minutes and post to the PortsToronto website.	PortsToronto
M#49-A2	BQNA representative to ask contacts from the National Yacht Club for interest in joining the CLC.	BQNA
M#49-A3	The Waterfront BIA representative to ask contacts from waterfront hotels and the arts and culture sector for interest in joining the CLC.	Waterfront BIA
M#49-A4	LURA to provide a recommendation on an approach to engage a local parent representative on the CLC.	LURA
M#49-A5	Ground Noise Study to identify impacts and potential mitigation measures associated with air carts.	PortsToronto via NMSC
M#49-A6	Mr. Furneaux to provide clarification on the City of Toronto process referenced under the 'Replicability' guiding principle in the revised TOR draft.	LURA
M#49-A7	PortsToronto to provide a response in writing to the suggestions shared by community members in the BQNA community update written submission.	PortsToronto
M#49-A8	PortsToronto to present an overview of Professor Florida's report at a future CLC meeting and circulate the report summary to CLC members.	PortsToronto
M#49-A9	CLC members to explore if an opposing viewpoint to the findings in Professor Florida's report on the economic impacts of a city airport can be presented at the CLC.	All
M#49-A10	LURA to circulate a list of meeting minutes where the aircraft curfew was discussed to CLC members.	LURA
M#49-A11	LURA to circulate the Annual Noise Summary Report – 2022 to CLC members, when available.	LURA
M#49-A12	LURA to provide PortsToronto with a summary of feedback on the Annual Noise Report discussed at previous NMSC meetings.	LURA
M#49-A13	CLC members to share feedback with Mr. Furneaux on their experience and impressions of the hybrid meeting format.	All

## List of Attendees

Name	Organization (if any)	Attendance
<b>COMMITTEE MEMBERS</b>		
Councillor Ausma Malik	Ward 10 – Spadina-Fort York	Regrets
Bushra Mir	On behalf of Ward 10 – Spadina-Fort York	Present - Online
MP Kevin Vuong	MP, Spadina-Fort York	Absent
Daiana Ferrari	On behalf of MP Kevin Vuong, Spadina-Fort York	Absent
Jay Paleja	City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat	Present - Online
Joanne Dobson	Air Canada	Regrets
Brad Cicero	Porter Airlines	Present - Online
Jennifer Quinn	Nieuport	Regrets
Cheryl Stone	Nieuport	Present - Online
Nadia Dzula	Nieuport	Present - Online
Matthew Kofsky	Toronto Board of Trade	Absent
William Peat	Ireland Park	Absent
Sarah Chapin	Waterfront Toronto	Present - Online
Joan Prowse	Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association (BQNA)	Present – Online
Bev Thorpe	Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association (BQNA)	Present – In-Person
David Chan	East Waterfront Community Association (EWCA)	Present – Online
Cathy Nguyen	East Waterfront Community Association (EWCA)	Present – Online
Hal Beck	York Quay Neighbourhood Association (YQNA)	Present – In-Person
Sarah Miller	Toronto Island Community Association (TICA)	Regrets
Natasha Francis	Waterfront Neighbourhood Centre	Present – Online
Commander Paul Smith	HMCS York	Present – Online
Dave Purkis	Nav Canada	Present – In-Person
Indren Nair	Nav Canada	Present – In-Person
Matt Slaman	Art & Water	Regrets
Oliver Hierlihy	Waterfront BIA	Present – In-Person
Tim Kocur	Waterfront BIA	Regrets
Mark Maloney	University of Toronto – Municipal Affairs	Present – In-Person
<b>PORTSTORONTO REPRESENTATIVES</b>		
Michael Antle (Chair)	PortsToronto	Present – In-Person
Roelof-Jan (RJ) Steenstra	PortsToronto	Present – In-Person
Deborah Wilson	PortsToronto	Present – In-Person
Angela Homewood	PortsToronto	Present – Online
Chris Sawicki	PortsToronto	Regrets
Michael Antle	PortsToronto	Present – In-Person
Bojan Drakul	PortsToronto	Present – In-Person
Mike MacWilliam	PortsToronto	Present – In-Person
Jessica Pellerin	PortsToronto	Regrets
Chris Pearce	PortsToronto	Present – In-Person
<b>FACILITATION</b>		
Alexander Furneaux	LURA Consulting	Present – Online
Franca Di Giovanni	LURA Consulting	Present – In-Person
Sayan Sivanesan	LURA Consulting	Present – In-Person

## Table of Contents

1.	Log-In & Welcome .....	1
2.	Review of Meeting Minutes & Action Items.....	1
3.	Welcoming New Members/Introductions.....	1
4.	Overview of the Revised Terms of Reference and CLC Mandate .....	1
5.	Update from the CEO.....	5
6.	CLC Member Updates .....	6
7.	Air Quality Study Update .....	9
8.	Business Arising .....	10

## Appendices

Appendix A – Meeting Agenda

Appendix B – Revised Terms of Reference and CLC Mandate Presentation

Appendix C – Revised Terms of Reference Draft

Appendix D – BQNA Community Update Written Submission

## 1. Log-In & Welcome

Alexander Furneaux (LURA) welcomed members of the Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport (abbreviated to Billy Bishop Airport subsequently) Community Liaison Committee (CLC) to the 49<sup>th</sup> committee meeting. Mr. Furneaux then provided an overview of the agenda.

The meeting agenda is included in **Appendix A**.

## 2. Review of Meeting Minutes & Action Items

Mr. Furneaux reviewed the status of the meeting minutes from CLC Meeting #48 held on November 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2022. Mr. Furneaux noted that these meeting minutes were shared with CLC members on February 9<sup>th</sup>, 2023, and requested that any comments on these meeting minutes be shared by March 5<sup>th</sup>, 2023. After this, the minutes will be finalized and published.

Mr. Furneaux also noted that he distributed a list of action items from previous meetings on February 13<sup>th</sup>, 2023. Mr. Furneaux requested that CLC members email him if there are any updates or follow-up requests to those action items.

M#49-A1      Finalize CLC Meeting #48 Minutes and post to the PortsToronto website.

## 3. Welcoming New Members/Introductions

Mr. Furneaux noted that there were several new members of the CLC attending who have joined as a result of the CLC refresh process. Mr. Furneaux facilitated a brief round of introductions from all members in attendance. Following the member introductions, Mr. Furneaux opened the floor for members to briefly share a few words about their organization.

The East Waterfront Community Association (EWCA) representative noted that in 2020 EWCA was involved in the City's public consultation on the Gardiner Expressway Rehabilitation Plan and worked with stakeholders to mitigate noise impacts to the East Waterfront neighbourhood from the project's construction activities. EWCA also participates in Metrolinx's Construction Liaison Committee for Corktown Station and is a member of Waterfront Toronto's Stakeholder Advisory Committees for the Quayside and Waterfront East Light Rail Transit (WELRT) projects.

Mr. Furneaux noted that the CLC is a valuable tool for enabling two-way dialogue between different interests and stakeholders around the airport, including PortsToronto, Nieuport, community members and local businesses. Mr. Furneaux expressed gratitude for the new members joining and participating.

The Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association (BQNA) representative noted that they are very happy that Commander Paul Smith (HMCS York) was able to join, as the BQNA representative had suggested him as a new member of the CLC. The BQNA representative welcomed all new members that have joined the committee.

## 4. Overview of the Revised Terms of Reference and CLC Mandate

Mr. Furneaux provided a brief presentation on the CLC Refresh and the Revised Terms of Reference and CLC Mandate. Mr. Furneaux's presentation can be found in **Appendix B**. Key points from Mr. Furneaux's presentation were:

- CLC is a body established voluntarily by PortsToronto and has been in operation since February 2011.

PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

- The CLC is a non-statutory forum for two-way dialogue between stakeholders and PortsToronto. The CLC's mandate is to act in an advisory capacity to PortsToronto's Senior Leadership Team in the spirit of collaboration oriented towards ongoing development, growth, operations, and activities of the airport. The CLC is not a venue for airing personal or individual grievances or making decisions about the current or future operations of the airport.
- The CLC Refresh process was initiated to update the CLC Terms of Reference (TOR) with community input, fill long-standing vacant positions, invite new voices from existing representative organizations, broaden stakeholder representation to align with Toronto's growing waterfront, and advance diversity and inclusion within the CLC.
- As part of the CLC Refresh process, LURA conducted interviews in Summer 2022 with 19 CLC members representing nine organizations and provided updates on the process at CLC #47 and #48.
- Input gathered through CLC member interviews was used to draft revisions to the TOR to reflect clarification of PortsToronto's jurisdiction and the CLC mandate, broadening of the CLC membership, updates to the terms of membership, and clarification of the role of the facilitator.
- An initial draft of the revised TOR was prepared by LURA and circulated to CLC members on February 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2023 (included in **Appendix C**). The revised TOR draft is open for input until March 31<sup>st</sup>, 2023.
- LURA will update the revised TOR draft based on the member input received and will recirculate the second draft to CLC members in mid-April 2023, with the goal of confirming the CLC TOR by CLC #50 on May 17, 2023.
- The CLC is still looking to fill vacant positions for Waterfront Toronto, a waterfront hotel, an arts, culture, and tourism sector representative, and the Yacht Club in the Inner Harbour.
- The CLC has broadened its stakeholder representation to align with Toronto's growing waterfront by adding representation from East Waterfront Community Association, HMCS York, Art & Water (formerly Pirate Life), University of Toronto – Municipal Affairs, and Waterfront Neighbourhood Centre. The CLC is also working to invite a representative from the Toronto Police Service (TPS).

Mr. Furneaux then opened the floor to questions from the CLC representatives.

The York Quay Neighbourhood Association (YQNA) representative asked for clarification on whether the selection of a representative from a Yacht Club would include criteria for being located in the Inner Harbour.

Mr. Furneaux confirmed that the criteria for a Yacht Club representative includes being located in the Inner Harbour and along the flight path of Billy Bishop Airport aircraft.

The BQNA representative asked whether the National Yacht Club, located at the western tip of the Western Channel across BBTCA's western runway, would be eligible to join the CLC.

Mr. Furneaux confirmed that the National Yacht Club would be considered eligible to join the CLC. Mr. Furneaux clarified that the Yacht Clubs that would not be eligible are those located further out along the waterfront, such as in Scarborough or Etobicoke.

The BQNA representative asked if a representative from The Waterfront School would be considered?

Mr. Furneaux responded that The Waterfront School (TDSB) was contacted through the contact provided by the BQNA representative, however the Principal of the Waterfront School indicated that they do not have capacity to participate on an ongoing basis. However, the TDSB remains on the email list for meeting minutes and other updates that are circulated to CLC members, so they will continue to be kept informed.

The YQNA representative asked for clarification on what Waterfront Hotel refers to in the presentation (Slide 6).

PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

Mr. Furneaux clarified that this refers to seeking representation from a waterfront hotel on the CLC. Mr. Furneaux encouraged CLC members that may have contacts with waterfront area hotels or yacht clubs to share this contact information with him to support the process of inviting new voices to the CLC.

The BQNA member noted that they could ask the National Yacht Club because they are a member there.

M#49-A2 BQNA representative to ask contacts from the National Yacht Club for interest in joining the CLC.

Jay Paleja (City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat) inquired how the CLC Refresh process chooses between a pool of candidates to select a representative for a specific category of organization, such as a waterfront hotel.

Mr. Furneaux explained that the representative is selected based on whoever emerges from the CLC membership's contacts that is responsive to outreach. Mr. Furneaux acknowledged that this is not a perfect system, but there is limited capacity within each of the organizations the CLC is seeking representation from.

The YQNA representative expressed concern about the CLC membership term that indicates that members should not be absent for three consecutive meetings. The YQNA representative noted that if TPS joins the CLC as a member, they may only be interested in attending one meeting per year, in which case they would miss three consecutive meetings. The YQNA representative indicated that TPS should not be discouraged from joining the CLC.

Mr. Furneaux clarified that the level of involvement that is desired of TPS is still open for discussion. Mr. Furneaux noted that he has not yet been able to speak with any TPS contacts to discuss their interest in participating on the CLC. Mr. Furneaux indicated that it may be more appropriate for TPS to serve as a resource representative similar to the involvement of organizations like Transport Canada, where representatives participate in meetings on an as-required basis.

The YQNA representative expressed his belief that it would be best to allow TPS to decide on how involved they want to be in the CLC. The YQNA representative noted that TPS could be invited to all meetings, and if TPS only chooses to attend one meeting per year that would be better than none.

Michael Antle (PortsToronto) noted that as a general rule when TPS participates in a community meeting, discussion tends to be focused on police related items rather than airport related discussion. Mr. Antle noted that TPS is an important partner to the airport but may be best involved in the CLC as a resource that is called in for specific meetings.

Mr. Furneaux added that the revised TOR draft that was shared is open for comment. Mr. Furneaux encouraged CLC members to share further comments on the matter of membership with LURA to be compiled and incorporated into the next draft.

The YQNA representative asked whether the Toronto Music Garden has been contacted regarding participation in the CLC as a representative of the arts, culture, and tourism sector.

Mr. Furneaux responded that the Toronto Music Garden has not been contacted and reiterated that it would be helpful if CLC members could share particular contacts that are known within the community.

The Waterfront BIA representative noted that they would reach out to contacts from waterfront hotels as well as the arts and culture sector for interest in joining the CLC.

M#49-A3 The Waterfront BIA representative to ask contacts from waterfront hotels and the arts and culture sector for interest in joining the CLC.

The YQNA representative noted that they are not opposed to any of the organizations that have been added to the TOR's list of potential members and indicated that the organizations would make great additions to the CLC whether they participate as standing members or as resource representatives.



PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

The BQNA representative inquired whether a parent of a child attending The Waterfront School could be considered for representation on the CLC, provided that they live in the neighbourhood.

Mr. Antle asked whether they would already be represented by a neighbourhood association, such as BQNA, if they live in the community.

The BQNA representative replied that parents could be represented by the neighbourhood associations but indicated that this is just an idea to include a specific representative for parents. The BQNA representative noted that the committee for the Bathurst Quay Mural Project (BQMP) had a member that was a parent of a child at The Waterfront School.

Mr. Furneaux confirmed that this will be considered as a suggestion to explore how local parents can be engaged.

The YQNA representative noted that both the City and PortsToronto have done a great job at addressing traffic and safety concerns around Eireann Quay in the past. The YQNA representative noted that the CLC would be a good forum for a parent or a safety representative to raise any issues regarding children crossing the intersection at Eireann Quay.

Mr. Furneaux confirmed that LURA would look into finding the requested representation and noted that if there are challenges in identifying appropriate representatives, LURA would ask existing CLC members to help in reaching out to contacts.

M#49-A4 LURA to provide a recommendation on an approach to engage a local parent representative on the CLC.

The YQNA representative asked for clarification on the City of Toronto process that is referenced in '*Replicability*' under 'Guiding Principles' on page eight (8) of the revised TOR draft.

Mr. Furneaux responded that he would look into this and provide a response.

M#49-A5 Mr. Furneaux to provide clarification on the City of Toronto process referenced under the '*Replicability*' guiding principle in the revised TOR draft.

The YQNA representative noted that under the '*Openness*' guiding principle, there is a typo – it should refer to four residents' associations, not three.

The YQNA representative then expressed concern that under section 3.2 Term, the wording seems to indicate that the onus is on individual representatives to respect term limits by voluntarily stepping down and appointing a new representative after the two-year term limit. The YQNA representative asked for clarification on why this is not framed as the responsibility of the board or organization that the individuals represent.

Mr. Furneaux clarified that what this term is trying to achieve is to encourage individual members to initiate the discussion with their board or organization about finding a new member when their term limit is approaching. Mr. Furneaux noted that the facilitator will not be reaching out to an organization about replacing or renewing its representative.

The YQNA representative suggested that a clause be added to this term that speaks to the role of the board or organization in replacing its representative after two years.

Mr. Furneaux thanked the YQNA representative for the suggestion and reiterated that members are welcome to submit additional comments on the revised TOR draft to LURA in writing.

## 5. Update from the CEO

Roelof-Jan (RJ) Steenstra (PortsToronto) provided a brief update from the CEO. Key points from Mr. Steenstra's update were:

- Billy Bishop Airport is continuing to progress in its recovery from the impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic and is currently operating at about 80% capacity compared to 2019 levels.
- PortsToronto has launched a new education program in partnership with [#NotInMyCity](#), an organization that works to disrupt and end sexual exploitation and trafficking, focusing on children and youth. This new program will include awareness training at BBTCA aimed at disrupting human trafficking in the region.
- In partnership with Nieuport Aviation, and with support from the City's ArtworxTO program, a new art installation titled '[Bloody Boats](#)' has been installed at Billy Bishop Airport. The piece is by a local artist named Akshata Naik. It honours the history of immigration in the Toronto region. CLC members are encouraged to visit the installation when in the terminal.
- The search to fill PortsToronto's vacant position of Vice President, Airport is underway and progressing.
- The tonnage of cargo moved by the Port of Toronto is up about 2%. The Port of Toronto's Cruise Ship Terminal is expecting 52 cruise ships, bringing about 17,000 visitors to the region, in the upcoming year.
- PortsToronto is celebrating the anniversary of the *Marilyn Bell I* ferry, which is the first 100% electric ferry service in Canada. PortsToronto is also working with Nieuport Aviation to electrify the airport shuttle buses.
- PortsToronto is continuing its work to open a U.S. customs preclearance facility at Billy Bishop Airport, and there will be upcoming announcements regarding this.
- PortsToronto in partnership with Nieuport Aviation sponsored The Bentway's Winter Skating program for the 2022/2023 winter season.
- PortsToronto is beginning a process to look at how to modernize the Tripartite Agreement.

Mr. Furneaux then opened the floor to questions from the CLC representatives.

The YQNA representative asked whether there are plans to electrify the other ferry.

Mr. Steenstra explained that the other ferry is a back-up ferry that is used when *Marilyn Bell I* is not in service, and that there are no plans to electrify the other ferry at the moment.

The BQNA representative indicated that the Harbourfront Centre is closing their skating rink due to funding issues, and that various community associations are working with elected officials to see if that rink can be kept open through sponsorships. The BQNA representative suggested that this could be a sponsorship opportunity for PortsToronto.

The BQNA representative noted that they do not remember seeing cruise ships in the harbour and asked if cruise ship visits are new.

Mr. Steenstra responded that cruise ship visits are not new. Mr. Steenstra explained that they may not have been seen because cruise ships use the passenger facility at the Eastern Gap on the other side of the harbour.

Bojan Drakul (PortsToronto) explained that the cruise ship industry in the Great Lakes has been growing significantly.

Deborah Wilson (PortsToronto) noted that there was a recent [blogTO article](#) about the cruise ships departing from the Port of Toronto to sail to destinations around the Great Lakes. Ms. Wilson explained that the cruise ships are not as large as ocean-faring cruise ships, carrying hundreds of passengers, as opposed to thousands of passengers.

PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

The BQNA representative noted their understanding that funding is needed from the Federal government for a U.S. customs preclearance facility at Billy Bishop Airport. The BQNA representative inquired whether this Federal government funding is moving ahead?

Mr. Steenstra responded that there is not a definitive answer on this yet but work towards this continues.

The YQNA representative inquired where the cruise ships to the Port of Toronto originate from.

Ms. Wilson responded that many of the cruise ships are coming from Montreal. Ms. Wilson indicated that a lot of European tourists fly to Montreal to board the cruise ships, which then sail the Great Lakes. Ms. Wilson indicated that these cruise ships are also popular in the fall season due to interest in seeing the fall leaves.

Mr. Steenstra noted that the demographic of tourists boarding these cruise ships are quite different than those on Caribbean cruises. Mr. Steenstra indicated that these passengers tend to be quite sophisticated and spend lots of money in our local economy.

The EWCA representative asked whether the passengers of the cruise ships disembark and spend time in the Toronto waterfront, or whether the cruise ships tend to pass by Toronto quickly.

Ms. Wilson responded that the cruise ships tend to dock for about two nights/three days. Ms. Wilson noted that passengers really enjoy their Toronto visit because they can quickly access downtown Toronto from the cruise ship via a 10-minute bus-trip to experience local arts, culture, and tourism activities during their stay.

The EWCA representative noted that the blogTO article mentions that some of the Great Lakes cruise ships charge upwards of \$16,685 per person, so these tourists are likely to spend a lot of money in the local community during their visit.

Mark Maloney (University of Toronto – Municipal Affairs) noted that the U.S. customs preclearance facility at Billy Bishop Airport is a tremendous opportunity for Toronto. Mr. Maloney asked for clarification on what is meant by there will be upcoming announcements regarding the U.S. customs preclearance facility, and whether there is a timeline for reaching the end of this process.

Mr. Steenstra responded that gaining acceptance for the U.S. customs preclearance facility is still very much a work-in-progress and that there is no definitive end date to that process at this point.

Mr. Antle added that even after the process for gaining approval for the U.S. customs preclearance facility is completed, there will still be about a two-year window for construction before the facility can be opened.

Mr. Maloney then inquired whether there have been any Open Houses in recent years for Billy Bishop Airport projects.

Ms. Wilson responded that there was an Open House as part of the 2018 Master Plan process. Ms. Wilson noted that Billy Bishop Airport has been approved as a site for the upcoming Doors Open Toronto program happening on Saturday May 27, 2023. Ms. Wilson noted that Billy Bishop Airport has participated in each of the previous five Doors Open Toronto programs, with the last program having occurred in 2019. Ms. Wilson indicated that in previous years Billy Bishop Airport has welcomed upwards of 15,000 visitors during the Doors Open Toronto event, and with appropriate safety precautions in place, visitors are allowed to visit areas such as the Fire Hall that would normally be closed-off to the public. Ms. Wilson noted that partners such as Nieuport Aviation and Porter Airlines will have activations at the Billy Bishop Airport Doors Open event.

## 6. CLC Member Updates

Mr. Furneaux noted that the BQNA representative had submitted a written community update in advance of this meeting for CLC discussion, which LURA circulated to CLC members earlier that day. The written BQNA community update can be found in **Appendix D**.

PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

The BQNA representative noted that this written submission is about frustration expressed by community members regarding the submission of noise complaints and not seeing any attempts to resolve the issues. The BQNA representative noted that the submission presents the community member comments in their own words and includes suggestions from community members to reduce the airport noise, especially in the early morning.

The BQNA representative provided a brief summary of the comments in the submission, noting frustrations expressed related to high-pitch noises from the airport's A/C-Heating units that begin at 5:30 AM, low-frequency and continuous noises from idling of aircrafts that cause window frames in buildings to vibrate, continuous low-level noise from engines revving with the engine exhausts facing buildings, amplification of all of the above noise issues when there are several planes in a row, and the loud noises related to take-offs and landings.

The BQNA representative noted that community members suggested that the early morning noise issues can be addressed by having airplanes dock on the south side of the airport, rather than the east and west sides of the airport, for early morning takeoffs. The BQNA representative noted that there are usually only two or three early morning flights, so this would only involve changing the boarding location for those specific flights. Furthermore, the community members suggested that these aircrafts should warm-up and idle where their exhaust faces south so that the trees and the airport building can block the associated sounds. The community members also suggested that aircrafts docking on the east and west sides of the airport can be warmed up later in the day, such as at 7:00 AM, as opposed to 5:30 AM. The BQNA representative indicated that community members would like to know what actions are taken as a result of their noise complaints.

Mr. Antle noted that PortsToronto received the BQNA representative's written submission that morning, so PortsToronto will need some time to review the submission in greater detail before responding. Mr. Antle noted that the Ground Noise Study that is underway through the CLC's Noise Management Subcommittee (NMSC) is close to completion and will help provide guidance on how to address some of the noise issues. Mr. Antle added that the Billy Bishop Airport Noise Management Office does look at all noise complaints received and takes corrective action where possible. Mr. Antle indicated that the noise of aircraft landings and takeoffs are also accounted for in the Noise Exposure Forecast (NEF) contours, which are used to measure the airport's noise impacts.

The YQNA representative noted their understanding that the NEF contours do not capture the noise of aircraft landings and takeoffs related to aircraft movements on the ground, but rather only the noise when in the air.

Mr. Antle reiterated that PortsToronto would like some time to review the comments and issues raised. Mr. Antle noted that there are days where there are no departures from the east side of the airport, however this side of the airport is where transborder operations take place, so it is where any early morning transborder flights have to takeoff from.

The BQNA representative reiterated that the written submission presents the community members comments in their own words to better communicate their frustration. The BQNA representative requested that PortsToronto provide a response in writing to the three suggestions put forward by community members.

Mr. Antle confirmed that a response would be provided, and expressed his desire to have a more detailed discussion once PortsToronto has had time to review the comments.

M#49-A6 PortsToronto to provide a response in writing to the suggestions shared by community members in the BQNA community update written submission.

The BQNA representative added that if PortsToronto would like to talk to the individual community members that made the suggestions, they would be able to make the connection.

Mike MacWilliam (PortsToronto) indicated that corrective actions should not be looked at from the scope of individual complaints, because actions like the Ground Noise Study and its installation of noise monitors are in

PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

response to the aggregate of many complaints received identifying ground noise as an issue. Mr. MacWilliam added that PortsToronto does also do enforcement based on noise complaints specific to individual aircrafts, noting the example of taking enforcement action based on complaints received about the operations of Island Air Flight School & Charters.

The BQNA representative encouraged PortsToronto to highlight these types of specific actions, as well as any modifications to operations, and relevant NMSC work in the response to the written submission.

The BQNA representative noted that last summer they were in communication with Mr. MacWilliam to identify the source of a disturbing high-pitched noise, and that they had suggested it sounded like an HVAC noise originating from the hangars. The BQNA representative indicated that it seems like the community member that contributed to the BQNA written submission has noticed the same noise. The BQNA representative asked for an update on the investigation to identify the source of the high-pitched noise they had reported last year.

Mr. MacWilliam responded that the air carts with the HVAC component are running at 5:30 AM, but they would not be running at 2:00 AM which is the time the BQNA representative had indicated they hear the high-pitched noise. Mr. MacWilliam indicated that the investigation was not able to identify the high-pitched noise reported to occur at 2:00 AM, and it is not clear whether the noise originates from the airport or elsewhere.

The BQNA representative indicated that they would appreciate if PortsToronto would take up the suggestion by community members about how to address the high-pitched noise that starts at 5:30 AM. The BQNA representative noted that this noise is very irritating and wakes residents up.

Mr. MacWilliam responded that the Ground Noise Study will identify the air carts as a ground noise source and will propose recommendations on how to mitigate this noise.

M#49-A7      Ground Noise Study to identify impacts and potential mitigation measures associated with air carts.

Mr. Furneaux noted that the NMSC has a similar reporting structure to the CLC. Mr. Furneaux encouraged CLC members to review the NMSC meeting minutes, because many issues being raised at this meeting such as the scope, progress and objectives of the Ground Noise Study are discussed at the NMSC. Mr. Furneaux noted that LURA would be happy to refer relevant NMSC meeting minutes to interested CLC members. Mr. Furneaux noted that the Ground Noise Study was put on hold during the COVID-19 pandemic, but updates on the Ground Noise Study are expected to be shared at the next NMSC meeting.

The EWCA representative noted that PortsToronto held a community meeting with EWCA last year. The EWCA representative indicated that this meeting was very informative and that community members really appreciate the various initiatives that PortsToronto is doing beyond the airport, such as environmental initiatives and improvements along the waterfront. The EWCA representative expressed that EWCA is interested in continuing to learn about these initiatives. The EWCA representative noted that the East Waterfront community will eventually have about 50,000 residents when all the developments in the area are completed, and that many of the residents really appreciate having the flexibility of being able to fly to destinations from BBTCA.

The YQNA representative asked for clarification on what are the geographic limits of the EWCA.

The EWCA representative responded that their boundary stretches from Yonge Street east to Cherry Street, along the waterfront. The EWCA representative noted that the EWCA area is a fast-developing neighbourhood that includes projects like Pinnacle One Yonge, Quayside, and the Waterfront East LRT Extension, as well as buildings such as the T3 Bayside timber office building and the George Brown College Waterfront Campus.

The YQNA representative suggested that the EWCA and YQNA should have a meeting to connect about mutual concerns in the area.

PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

The EWCA representative confirmed that the EWCA works very closely with other neighbourhood associations including the YQNA, the St. Lawrence Neighbourhood Association (SLNA), and the West Don Lands Committee. The EWCA representative noted that their association stays engaged with the parklands and developments being planned in the Port Lands as well.

The YQNA representative inquired whether the emails of CLC members can be included when the meeting minutes are shared, noting that they would like to know the emails of the new members.

Mr. Furneaux responded that the emails of members are not included when minutes are shared in the interest of privacy. Mr. Furneaux suggested that if the contact information for a particular member is desired by an individual, they can request this from him and he can check that the member is comfortable with sharing their contact information.

Mr. Maloney noted that Professor Richard Florida from the University of Toronto released a new report a few weeks ago about the economic impact of BBTCA. Mr. Maloney asked whether that report would be discussed at this committee.

Ms. Wilson responded that the report, titled, *Toronto's Downtown Airport: A Powerful Economic Asset in the City's Urban Core*, is available on the PortsToronto [website](#). Ms. Wilson indicated that there is a summary of the report available that PortsToronto can circulate, and if there is interest from members the report can be discussed at the next CLC meeting. Ms. Wilson explained that the report looks at what a city airport does in terms of economic impacts. Ms. Wilson noted that the report was going to be released in February 2020, but was postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic, and then was refreshed to reflect the post COVID-19 pandemic context and released in January 2023.

Mr. Furneaux confirmed that a high-level overview of the report can be added as an agenda item for an upcoming CLC meeting.

M#49-A8 PortsToronto to present an overview of Professor Florida's report at a future CLC meeting and circulate the report summary to CLC members.

The YQNA representative suggested that an opposing view to the report's findings should also be presented. The YQNA representative noted that there are many people in the community that consider the disbenefits of a city airport and not just the benefits. The YQNA representative expressed a desire to have a balanced view of the airport's impacts represented at the committee and in its meeting minutes.

Ms. Wilson asked if the YQNA representative would recommend someone to represent an opposing economic view.

The YQNA representative responded that someone would need to be identified and affirmed that there are diverse perspectives in the community on this matter.

Mr. Furneaux noted that if a speaker or organization with a different perspective on Professor Florida's report is identified, they would be welcome to present at the CLC.

Ms. Wilson noted that Professor Florida's report is focused on the economic impacts of the airport, so someone identified to present an opposing view would need to also focus on economic impacts.

M#49-A9 CLC members to explore if an opposing viewpoint to the findings in Professor Florida's report on the economic impacts of a city airport can be presented at the CLC.

## 7. Air Quality Study Update

The BQNA representative provided an update on the Air Quality Study. The BQNA representative shared that the measurement stage of the study has concluded, and the Air Quality Study's Communications Sub-Committee is

now considering how to present the findings to the public. The sub-committee would like to hire a third-party facilitator to facilitate a public workshop where the results are shared but will need to secure funding for this. The sub-committee is also evaluating whether a workshop presenting the data gathered should occur in the spring, or whether the workshop should occur at a later date so that the University of Toronto researchers can conduct further analysis through modeling scenarios based on the data.

Angela Homewood (PortsToronto) added that the University of Toronto researchers are still conducting their initial analysis of the data over the next six weeks, and will present their findings to the sub-committee after that time. Ms. Homewood noted that further information can be gathered by conducting modeling work, and so the University of Toronto researchers are thinking it would be appropriate for the workshop to occur in the fall to give sufficient time for modelling work and for the workshop facilitators to prepare. Ms. Homewood added that a fall workshop date may also be more appropriate given the timing of the upcoming mayoral by-election.

The BQNA representative noted that the sub-committee discussed being willing to work longer, even though the initial project timeline has ended, and that the sub-committee is looking forward to receiving a presentation from the researchers in six weeks.

Mr. Paleja noted that it would be helpful for the public to gain an understanding of what data has been collected by the Ground Noise Study through an initial workshop, so that the pain-points identified through the study and the opportunities for practical solutions can be socialized in advance. Mr. Paleja recommended that the workshop should present information in a manner that facilitates ideas from the community being gathered.

## 8. Business Arising

The EWCA representative asked for clarification on whether Billy Bishop Airport operates under different noise regulations than the rest of the city. The EWCA representative noted that the City's [Noise Bylaw](#) restricts certain noises between 7:00 PM to 7:00 AM. The EWCA representative asked if the City's Noise Bylaw does not apply to BBTCA given that it has operations starting as early as 5:30 AM.

Mr. Antle explained that Billy Bishop Airport does follow the City's bylaws as much as possible, such as when BBTCA does construction work on the mainland. However, Billy Bishop Airport's runway use, and aircraft operations falls under Transport Canada regulations.

Mr. MacWilliam added that air transportation is federally regulated, which is why BBTCA operates under different rules than what the City normally allows. Mr. MacWilliam affirmed that BBTCA does try to follow City bylaws where possible, such as complying to noise bylaws related to construction. Mr. MacWilliam noted that the airport does have policies such as an aircraft curfew to limit noise impacts to the community.

Mr. Furneaux noted that the aircraft curfew and the consequences of curfew violation were discussed at previous CLC meetings. Mr. Furneaux noted that LURA can circulate a reference list to CLC members on past meeting minutes where the aircraft curfew was discussed to help acquaint new members with the airport's existing noise mitigation practices.

M#49-A10 LURA to circulate a list of meeting minutes where the aircraft curfew was discussed to CLC members.

The YQNA representative noted that PortsToronto has been very helpful in addressing noise related to the airfield expansion by transitioning to transport construction materials by barge from the Eastern Gap instead of by trucks. The YQNA representative noted that between 2010 to 2015, local residents were being woken up between 2:00 to 5:00 AM by noise from trucking. The YQNA representative noted that PortsToronto listened to community member concerns and transitioned to only using barges to transport construction materials for the last few years, which has helped the community a lot.

PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

Mr. Antle noted that these are the type of issues that the CLC aims to discuss so that mitigations can be identified wherever possible.

The EWCA representative noted that construction noise from the Gardiner Expressway Rehabilitation was causing tremendous disruption to their community, but through the project's consultation process the community was able to get noise monitors installed to mitigate this. The noise monitors alerted construction when noise exceeded a certain limit, which led to work being stopped. The EWCA representative expressed that stakeholders working together is the best way to mitigate issues.

The YQNA representative noted that the City of Toronto conducted a [Noise Bylaw Review](#), which included public meetings to gather input from a variety of stakeholders.

Ms. Wilson noted that the [Billy Bishop Annual Noise Summary Report - 2022](#) will be published at the end of this month on the BBTCA Noise Management Program [webpage](#). Ms. Wilson noted that this report compiles all the noise complaints received in 2022.

Mr. MacWilliam shared that there were 376 noise complaints in 2022, 21 of which were found to be unrelated to airport operations. Mr. MacWilliam indicated that majority of the complaints were related to aircraft operations. Mr. MacWilliam noted that there was a decrease in complaints from Toronto Island residents and indicated that this is likely due to the return of commercial air operations which has led to a decrease in general aviation activities. Mr. MacWilliam noted that the greatest increase in complaints was related to ground noise caused by the idling of aircrafts.

Ms. Wilson noted that because operations only resumed after the COVID-19 pandemic on September 8, 2021, the report's year-over-year comparison compares 12 months in 2022 with only four months in 2021. Ms. Wilson indicated that the 2019 year might be a more appropriate year for comparison and noted that all the previous Annual Noise Reports are available on the webpage.

The YQNA representative asked whether the Annual Noise Report will be presented at the next CLC meeting.

Mr. Furneaux noted that typically the Annual Noise Report is presented to the NMSC, but this can also be presented at the CLC if there is additional interest.

Ms. Wilson noted that LURA will circulate the Annual Noise Report and asked that any questions be sent through LURA in advance of the next meeting.

M#49-A11 LURA to circulate the Annual Noise Summary Report – 2022 to CLC members.

Ms. Wilson noted that the Annual Noise Report includes a Glossary of Terms which was previously suggested from the NMSC. Ms. Wilson asked Mr. Furneaux to resend any additional feedback that may have been discussed at previous NMSC meetings.

M#49-A12 LURA to provide PortsToronto with a summary of feedback on the Annual Noise Report discussed at previous NMSC meetings.

Mr. Furneaux reminded CLC members to share any comments on the CLC #48 meeting minutes by March 5<sup>th</sup>, 2023, and that after this they will be finalized and published.

Ms. Wilson reminded CLC members to share feedback on their impressions of the hybrid meeting experience. Ms. Wilson shared her opinion that the hybrid format may not be working and that it may be better if all meeting participants are present either online or in-person. Ms. Wilson suggested that each year there can be two CLC meetings that are scheduled to happen online, and two meetings that are scheduled to happen in-person. Ms. Wilson suggested that meetings during the winter months can happen online, while meetings in the summer months can happen in-person.



PortsToronto Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport Community Liaison Committee  
Meeting #49 – November 23, 2022

Mr. Furneaux added that LURA has not received much feedback from CLC members on the hybrid meeting format and asked members to share their feedback with LURA. Mr. Furneaux indicated that based on this feedback, LURA will report-back to CLC members on what the format will be going forward.

M#49-A13 CLC members to share feedback with Mr. Furneaux on their experience and impressions of the hybrid meeting format.

Mr. Furneaux thanked the members for their participation.

The meeting adjourned at approximately 8:30 p.m.