



PortsToronto

Billy Bishop Toronto City Airport

Community Liaison Committee

Meeting #46

Meeting Minutes

May 24, 2022

Virtual Meeting

Toronto, Ontario

Minutes prepared by:





These meeting minutes were prepared by LURA Consulting. LURA provides neutral third-party consultation services for the Ports Toronto Community Liaison Committee (CLC). These minutes are not intended to provide verbatim accounts of committee discussions. Rather, they summarize and document the key points made during the discussions, as well as the outcomes and actions arising from the committee meetings. If you have any questions or comments regarding the Meeting Minutes, please contact either:

Gene Cabral

EVP- Billy Bishop Toronto City
Airport

PortsToronto

Phone: 416-203-6942 ext. 16

GCabral@torontoport.com

OR

Alexander Furneaux

CLC Facilitator

LURA Consulting

Phone: 289-768-5561

afurneaux@lura.ca



Summary of Action Items from Meeting #46

Action Item	Action Item Task	Who is Responsible for Action Item
M#46-A1	Finalize CLC Meeting #45 Minutes and post to the PortsToronto website.	PortsToronto
M#46-A2	Include information on Q400 aircraft movements in future airline passenger recovery updates.	PortsToronto
M#46-A3	Add examples of efforts to support emission reductions in the community to the 'Responses to Comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report' document (Page 17).	PortsToronto
M#46-A4	Add examples of efforts to identify Scope 3 emissions with partners to the 'Responses to Comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report' document (Page 16).	PortsToronto
M#46-A5	Provide information on how to report idling issues to the City.	Waterfront Secretariat
M#46-A6	Refresh ferry ramp flap with new noise deadening matting and develop a routine maintenance program for refreshing the matting going forward.	PortsToronto
M#46-A7	Organize "Airport Site Visits" for CLC members to tour areas of interest at the airport, as per M#40-A3.	PortsToronto
M#46-A8	Work with the BQNA representative on improving the community noise complaint forms.	PortsToronto
M#46-A9	Send PortsToronto a copy of the BQNA motion requesting postponement of planned slot increase, and an audio recording of noise heard on May 20 th	BQNA
M#46-A10	Provide a summary of noise data that was captured by the ferry terminal building noise monitor on May 20 th from 7pm to 9pm.	PortsToronto
M#46-A11	Provide Meg St John with onboarding materials for joining the Air Quality Study project team.	BQNA
M#46-A12	Request Air Quality Study researchers to post an update on project website regarding air monitors on residential buildings.	PortsToronto
M#46-A13	Confirm that a link to the meeting summary for the Air Quality Study public meeting held on January 27 th is included in the CLC #45 meeting minutes.	LURA
M#46-A14	Distribute documents regarding Air Quality Study updates and project background information to CLC members.	LURA

List of Attendees

Name	Organization (if any)	Attendance
COMMITTEE MEMBERS		
Brent Gilliard	On behalf of Ward 10 – Spadina-Fort York	Absent
Bushra Mir	On behalf of Ward 10 – Spadina-Fort York	Absent
Zara Sajjad	On behalf of MP Kevin Vuong, Spadina-Fort York	Absent
MP Kevin Vuong	MP, Spadina-Fort York	Absent
Meg St John	City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat	Present
Michael Perry	Air Canada	Absent
Brad Cicero	Porter Airlines	Present
Jennifer Quinn	Nieuport	Absent
Cheryl Stone	Nieuport	Present
Matthew Kofsky	Toronto Board of Trade	Absent
Jonathan Ricci	Toronto Board of Trade	Present
William Peat	Ireland Park	Absent
Chris Glaisek	Waterfront Toronto	Absent
Joan Prowse	Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association (BQNA)	Present
Bev Thorpe	Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association (BQNA)	Present
Hal Beck	York Quay Neighbourhood Association (YQNA)	Present
Sarah Miller	Toronto Island Community Association (TICA)	Absent
Thomas Murphy	Nav Canada	Absent
Oliver Hierlihy	Waterfront BIA	Present
Tim Kocur	Waterfront BIA	Absent
PORTSTORONTO REPRESENTATIVES		
Angela Homewood	PortsToronto	Present
Gene Cabral – Chair	PortsToronto	Present
Chris Sawicki	PortsToronto	Absent
Michael Antle	PortsToronto	Present
Bojan Drakul	PortsToronto	Present
Deborah Wilson	PortsToronto	Present
Mike MacWilliam	PortsToronto	Present
Jessica Pellerin	PortsToronto	Present
Mike David	PortsToronto	Present
FACILITATION		
Alexander Furneaux	LURA Consulting	Present
Sayan Sivanesan	LURA Consulting	Present

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	iii
1. Welcome and Introductions.....	1
2. Review of Previous Meeting Minutes.....	1
3. Airline Passenger Recovery Updates	1
4. Sustainability Report Questions	2
5. CLC Refresh	7
6. Community Updates.....	10
7. Air Quality Study Update	12
8. Noise Management Sub-Committee Update.....	13
9. Business Arising	13

Appendices

Appendix A – Meeting Agenda

Appendix B – PortsToronto Presentation on Airline Passenger Recovery Updates

Appendix C – PortsToronto Presentation on Responses to Comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report

Appendix D – LURA Consulting Presentation on the CLC Refresh

Appendix E – Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association Community Member Photos

Appendix F - Noise Management Subcommittee 2020-2021 Year In Review

1. Welcome and Introductions

Alexander Furneaux (LURA Consulting) welcomed members of the Billy Bishop Airport (BBTCA) Community Liaison Committee (CLC) to the 46th committee meeting and provided an overview of the agenda.

The meeting agenda is included in **Appendix A**.

2. Review of Previous Meeting Minutes

Mr. Furneaux reviewed the status of the meeting minutes from CLC Meeting #45 held on February 16th, 2022. Mr. Furneaux noted that these meeting minutes were shared with CLC members on April 27th, 2022 and requested that any comments on these meeting minutes be shared by June 15th, 2022. After this, the minutes will be finalized and published.

M#46-A1 Finalize CLC Meeting #45 Minutes and post to the PortsToronto website.

3. Airline Passenger Recovery Updates

Gene Cabral (PortsToronto) provided a presentation on airline passenger recovery updates. Mr. Cabral's presentation on airline passenger recovery updates is included in **Appendix B**.

Key points from Mr. Cabral's updates on this topic include the following:

- Total Canadian passenger traffic in March 2022 was 55% of March 2019 levels. Mr. Cabral noted that an uptick began in March 2022 following the end of public health restrictions from the Omicron COVID-19 wave, and that this upward trajectory continued in April.
- Total passenger traffic at BBTCA in April 2022 was 45% of April 2019 levels. Mr. Cabral noted that an uptick began in March that continued, reaching approximately 100,000 passengers in April. Mr. Cabral indicated that the easing of COVID-19 testing requirements starting on April 1st contributed to the uptick.
- Total aircraft movements at BBTCA in April 2022 was 78% of April 2019 levels. Mr. Cabral noted that an uptick began in March that continued in April, reaching over 8,000 total aircraft movements.
- Mr. Cabral indicated that the effect of pent-up demand for travel is currently being felt in airports across Canada. In the last 7 days, total Canadian passenger traffic reached 81% of 2019 levels. This demand represents a 950% increase compared to 2021 levels and a 2,117% increase compared to 2020 levels.
- Total Canadian passenger traffic on Sunday May 15th and Saturday May 21st were 91% of 2019 levels and represent the highest single days of passenger traffic in Canada since the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic.
- Mr. Cabral noted that the sharp increase in Canadian passenger traffic due to pent-up demand is contributing to strains on aviation systems across Canada including with government agencies such as Canadian Air Transport Security Authority (CATSA) and Canadian Border Services Agency (CBSA), and with overall labour.
- Total U.S. passenger traffic has plateaued between 85% to 90% of 2019 levels for some time now, with a low of 74% in January 2022 during the peak of the COVID-19 wave caused by the Omicron variant. Mr. Cabral noted that because markets such as the U.S. did not experience as severe restrictions as Canada, they have been able to adapt to growth in air travel demand much more gradually.

Mr. Cabral then opened the floor up for any questions from CLC members.

The York Quay Neighbourhood Association (YQNA) representative noted that there is a large discrepancy between the recovery of total passengers in April 2022 (45% of April 2019 levels) compared to the recovery of

total aircraft movements in April 2022 (78% of April 2019 levels). The YQNA representative inquired whether it is possible to better align the number of aircraft movements with the number of passengers.

Mr. Cabral responded that the number of aircraft movements do not have a direct correlation with the number of passengers because majority of aircraft movements at BBTCA are general aviation, flight schools and charter flights. Mr. Cabral noted that passenger numbers are predominantly driven by Porter Airlines and Air Canada flights, but these flights represent less than half of the total aircraft movements typically at BBTCA.

The YQNA representative asked if the number of Q400 aircraft movements could be included in future presentations, for comparison with the number of total passengers.

Mr. Cabral confirmed that information on Q400 aircraft movements can be included in presentations going forward.

M#46-A2 PortsToronto to include information on Q400 aircraft movements in future airline passenger recovery updates.

The Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association (BQNA) representative asked for clarification on whether smaller airports would be impacted by the recent spike in air travel demand.

Mr. Cabral responded that the largest airports in Canada have been the most impacted by staffing issues and security constraints related to outdated public health policies. He indicated that other airports are also impacted but not to the same degree as larger airports. Mr. Cabral noted that when Toronto Pearson Airport faces constraints this can impact many other down-line airports that have flights from Toronto Pearson Airport feeding into them.

The BQNA representative noted that the Bathurst Quay community has observed an increase in the number of planes idling on the BBTCA runway. The BQNA representative asked whether this increase is related to the constraints being experienced at Toronto Pearson Airport.

Mr. Cabral responded that this issue is not related to Toronto Pearson Airport and is due to staffing challenges at BBTCA that are being addressed. Mr. Cabral noted that these staffing challenges are being experienced by many airports across the country.

The BQNA representative indicated that the community has never noticed this level of planes idling at BBTCA before and inquired why this is happening now.

Mr. Cabral indicated that BBTCA has experienced similar challenges in the past and asked Brad Cicero (Porter Airlines) to comment on the challenges.

Mr. Cicero explained that the challenges are caused by a combination of factors including staffing shortages and bad weather. Mr. Cicero indicated that BBTCA is working to mitigate the impacts from staffing shortages in the short term while working to resolve staffing shortages fully in the longer term. Mr. Cicero added that bad weather in other regions can cause flights to become off schedule and arrive at BBTCA later than expected, which can lead to clusters of planes waiting on the runway to get to their gate. Mr. Cicero indicated that these challenges do not come up every day but happen sporadically, and that the airport and airlines are working to eliminate them entirely.

4. Sustainability Report Questions

Deborah Wilson (PortsToronto) provided an overview of responses to comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report. Ms. Wilson noted that the 2021 Sustainability Report was first published on March 29th, 2022, and that the CLC was given four weeks to submit questions and comments, so that PortsToronto would

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

have four weeks to prepare the responses. The responses to comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report is included in **Appendix C**. The following is a summary of the updates and discussion on the responses provided.

Ms. Wilson noted that BBTCA has a very good relationship with Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation (MCFN). BBTCA has been meeting with MCFN quarterly since 2017, and MCFN is included in outreach related to capital expenditures. Ms. Wilson noted that MCFN was consulted on the development of the BBTCA Master Plan.

Mr. Cabral noted that BBTCA had a recent meeting with MCFN, during which the BBTCA Master Plan and planned slot increases were discussed.

Bojan Drakul (PortsToronto) added that he delivers the same presentation on capital program updates to MCFN that he provides to the CLC. He noted that MCFN provides input on what activities they would like to be involved in.

Ms. Wilson then addressed why the electrified Marilyn Bell was included in the 2021 Sustainability Report even though it was not returned to service until December 15, 2021. Ms. Wilson noted that PortsToronto has been working on the electrification of the Marilyn Bell ferry for all of 2020 and 2021. Ms. Wilson expressed that because a substantial portion of the electrification happened in 2021, it is appropriate that the Marilyn Bell ferry be included in the 2021 report. Ms. Wilson also noted that BBTCA is very proud of the accomplishment because the project represents a first for Canada and because the project was completed during the COVID-19 pandemic.

The BQNA representative indicated that the emissions reductions related to the electrified Marilyn Bell ferry presented in the report may be confusing. The BQNA representative noted that the report may give the impression that 530 tonnes of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions were reduced in 2021 because of the project and suggested that this should be clarified to state that the conversion will have the effect of removing these emissions in future years.

Ms. Wilson agreed that the tense originally used in the report could be misleading. Ms. Wilson shared that the report has been updated to convey that 530 tonnes will be removed instead of was removed.

Ms. Wilson then explained why the ferry was identified as the most direct source of emissions at BBTCA. Ms. Wilson noted that the ferry emissions are Scope 1 emissions and that the Toronto Public Health presentation delivered to the CLC on May 3, 2017, confirmed that the ferry was a significant contributor to GHG emissions in the area, based on modeling.

Mike David (PortsToronto) explained that Scope 1 emissions are GHG emissions that are a direct byproduct of onsite BBTCA operations.

Ms. Wilson noted that the definitions of the different emission scopes are provided on page 17 of the report, and that a link to the meeting minutes where Toronto Public Health identified the ferry as the most significant source of direct emissions from BBTCA was also included.

Ms. Wilson noted that descriptions of what are direct and indirect emission sources are not included in the executive message, because the executive message is intended to be a top line narrative of the report.

Ms. Wilson then explained that the data collected by the noise management terminals is raw data that cannot be easily interpreted, which is why it is not available publicly. Ms. Wilson noted that this data is primarily used by PortsToronto to help correlate aircraft movements with noise complaints. Ms. Wilson indicated that if there was something specific that the community is looking for, then Michael MacWilliam (PortsToronto) could look into creating a user-friendly report from the raw data.

Mr. MacWilliam confirmed that he could do this and added that he is working on creating a monthly report that is easily understandable.

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

Ms. Wilson then addressed a question on how many medevac flights took off overnight in 2021. Ms. Wilson explained that overnight is defined as 11:00pm to 6:45am. Ms. Wilson shared that in 2021, 719 medevac flights took off overnight, out of 5,091 total medevac flights.

Ms. Wilson then responded to a question on how BBTCA is working to support emission reductions in the community. Ms. Wilson noted that the purpose of the Sustainability Report is to communicate how BBTCA is working to reduce GHG emissions and invest in Environmental, Social, and Governance (ESG) goals that are meaningful. Ms. Wilson indicated that if there is a more specific question on BBTCA's work to reduce emissions, then she would be happy to respond to that.

The BQNA representative asked if there are any examples of work supporting community emission reductions that can be shared.

Ms. Wilson responded that the sustainability report has many examples embedded throughout. She noted that a couple of those examples can be added to the document detailing BBTCA responses to comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report.

M#46-A3 PortsToronto to add examples of efforts to support emission reductions in the community to the 'Responses to Comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report' document (Page 17).

Mr. David then responded to a question on how BBTCA is working with its partners to better identify Scope 3 emissions. Mr. David indicated that this is a very complicated task because there are thousands of factors that need to be understood, and BBTCA is attempting to work through this with its partners. Mr. David indicated that examples of this work can be added to the responses document as well.

M#46-A4 PortsToronto to add examples of efforts to identify Scope 3 emissions with its partners to the 'Responses to Comments on the BBTCA 2021 Sustainability Report' document (Page 16).

Ms. Wilson noted that on page 19 the tense was changed to clarify that the electric ferry will eliminate the consumption of approximately 196,000 litres of diesel fuel per year, as opposed to saying has removed previously.

Ms. Wilson then addressed a question on how BBTCA enforces the anti-idling policy, with respect to buses, taxis, and vehicles waiting to pick up passengers, and whether enforcement can be extended to surrounding neighbourhood streets. Ms. Wilson noted that BBTCA can not enforce policy outside of its property, and that within its property BBTCA monitors and consults directly with its tenants to enforce the anti-idling policy.

The BQNA representative indicated that they have noticed an increase in shuttle bus idling since Nieuport took ownership of the terminals. The BQNA representative suggested that PortsToronto staff standing in the area could tell the bus drivers not to idle.

Mr. MacWilliam responded that Nieuport is responsible for instructing its bus drivers on the anti-idling policy. Mr. MacWilliam noted that Nieuport enforcing the policy with its own drivers would be more effective than PortsToronto staff instructing the drivers.

Cheryl Stone (Nieuport) expressed that they would take this feedback back to the Nieuport team. Ms. Stone expressed that Nieuport looks forward to having more conversations on how to make the shuttle service more environmentally friendly.

Facilitator's Note: Following the meeting, Nieuport announced on June 23, 2022 that they are planning to electrify the airport shuttle bus in 2023. This announcement was shared by email to the CLC and can be read online on [Nieuport Aviation's media announcement page](#).

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

Mr. Cabral noted that this issue has been raised multiple times. Mr. Cabral indicated that before the pandemic there was very good compliance with the anti-idling policy, but PortsToronto can follow up with Nieuport and other tenants on enforcing the policy.

The YQNA representative inquired whether it would be City of Toronto's responsibility to enforce non-idling outside of BBTCA property. The YQNA representative noted that especially during the summertime, fumes from idling vehicles come up and waft into the windows of nearby residential buildings and discourage residents from having their windows open. The YQNA representative asked what steps could be taken to get City inspectors to be involved in enforcement on waterfront neighbourhood streets.

Meg St John (City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat) indicated that based on a search they conducted, the City's permit parking office is the appropriate contact for enforcing idling by-laws.

The YQNA representative asked whether Ms. St John could provide a one-pager guide detailing what steps should be taken to report idling.

Ms. St John confirmed that she would investigate what steps should be taken and will share this information with Mr. Furneaux for distribution to the CLC.

M#46-A5 Meg St John to provide information on how to report idling issues to the City.

Facilitator's Note: Following the meeting, Meg St John shared, through the facilitator the following response from the Supervisor of Permit Parking in the City of Toronto's Transportation Services Division:

Presently, our objective is compliance through information and education. We encourage citizens/residents to contact our office anytime they witness excessive idling. Ideally, an email would be best. Please have them email permit.parking@toronto.ca with the following details:

- *Licence plate number*
- *Brief description of the vehicle*
- *Date and time*
- *Location*

For example: A red Ferrari, plate ABC123 was parked near 100 Queen St W on May 30th at 9am and was idling for more than 1-minute.

Alternatively, people can call us at 416-392-7873. We are open 8:30 a.m. to 4:15 p.m., Monday to Friday.

The information allows us to send a letter to the vehicle owner. The letter is a provides details regarding the bylaw and consequences if not compliant.

At some point this summer, my officers plan on doing a blitz of the Billy Bishop area to help mitigate the idling.

Ms. Wilson then addressed a question asking whether BBTCA would consider changing the ferry hours so that the ferry starts later and finishes earlier. Ms. Wilson responded that PortsToronto is not exploring a change to the ferry hours. Ms. Wilson noted that the ferry electrification was a major investment made by BBTCA to reduce the noise and environmental impact of the ferry. Ms. Wilson also noted that overnight ferry operations are related to medevac services.

Mr. MacWilliam added that the ferry hours are linked to BBTCA's operational hours. Mr. MacWilliam noted that the ferry must be in service at 5:15 am to allow airport personal to get to the airport to start airport operations by 6:45 pm. Mr. MacWilliam noted that the ferry would only run overnight in the rare occurrence that there is

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

an operational issue or if there were an emergency that would require getting people off the island. Mr. MacWilliam emphasized that the ferry running overnight is not part of normal operations.

The YQNA representative noted that the Noise Management Sub-Committee has asked Mr. David to provide a summary of ferry noise impacts before and after electrification, so that the sub-committee can evaluate the level of improvement.

The BQNA representative inquired whether there is a way to reduce the noise from the ferry ramp being lowered. The BQNA representative noted that the banging from the ferry ramp being lowered wakes community members up in the morning.

Mr. MacWilliam noted that the ferry does have rubber matting underneath the ferry ramp flap to deaden the noise. Mr. MacWilliam noted that during a recent inspection he conducted he noticed that the matting is not deadening the noise like it used to. Mr. MacWilliam confirmed that this old matting will be replaced with new matting.

The YQNA representative noted that during construction periods in previous years, the matting was worn out very quickly. The YQNA representative asked whether a proactive maintenance response can be implemented that is tied to the volume of vehicle traffic going over the flap.

Mr. MacWilliam indicated that he does not believe this issue is heavily related to traffic levels. Mr. MacWilliam noted that he could develop a routine maintenance program for refreshing the matting.

M#46-A6 PortsToronto to refresh ferry ramp flap with new noise deadening matting and to develop a routine maintenance program for refreshing the matting going forward.

Ms. Wilson then responded to a comment seeking clarification on whether past CLC questions regarding glycol and de-icing management had been addressed. Ms. Wilson explained that Mr. Furneaux reviewed the past CLC meeting minutes to identify any unresolved questions regarding this topic. Ms. Wilson noted that an outstanding request was identified from the CLC #40 (November 18, 2020) minutes, where the YQNA representative requested to tour areas of the airport including the glycol management system. Ms. Wilson indicated that now that restrictions related to the COVID-19 pandemic have been lifted, this site tour can be arranged.

M#46-A7 PortsToronto to organize “Airport Site Visits” for CLC members to tour areas of interest at the airport, as per M#40-A3.

Ms. Wilson noted that a change was made to Page 37 so that Bathurst Quay Neighbourhood Association is spelled out in full and is described as an equal partner in the air quality study.

Ms. Wilson noted that footnotes have been added throughout the Sustainability Report to specify that the presentation by Barbara Lachapelle (Toronto Public Health) at CLC #26 (May 3, 2017) is the source referenced for statements regarding the largest contributors of GHG emissions to the local community.

Ms. Wilson also noted that a [map](#) provided by Toronto Public Health showing Traffic-Related Air Pollution (TRAP) was used to determine the air-shed that the community is a part of.

The BQNA representative asked whether Barbara Lachapelle referenced the 2013 [Golder report](#) during their presentation at CLC #26.

Angela Homewood (PortsToronto) responded that Toronto Public Health commissioned Golder to conduct the Health Impact Assessment in 2013. Ms. Homewood noted that Golder used data provided by Toronto Public Health and Health Canada for the modeling exercise used in its assessment. Then during the BBTCA Master Plan consultation process, Toronto Public Health referenced this modeling from the 2013 Golder Report to identify BBTCA’s diesel ferry operation as a key contributor to emissions impacting the community.

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

Ms. Homewood noted that in addition to the 2013 Golder Report, Toronto Public Health also referenced its 2017 [TRAP study](#) during the 2017 consultations on the BBTCA Master Plan.

The BQNA representative expressed that it is important to include the date of any studies that are referenced in the Sustainability Report so that the age of the studies is clear to the reader.

Ms. Wilson agreed and noted that the footnotes that have been added to the Sustainability Report now provide this clarity on the information source.

The BQNA representative noted that following Barbara Lachapelle's presentation at CLC #26, there was a presentation delivered by several community members about the health impact of airport operations on their communities. The BQNA representative expressed frustration that while the Barbara Lachapelle presentation is referenced many times, the Sustainability Report does not refer to the presentations made by community members regarding their lived experience. The BQNA representative indicated that they made this point during the review of the 2020 Sustainability Report as well and would like the point to be noted again.

Ms. Homewood clarified that in addition to presenting at CLC #26, Toronto Public Health referenced the 2013 Golder Report and 2017 TRAP study when providing input as subject matter experts during the BBTCA Master Plan consultation process. Ms. Homewood noted that Toronto Public Health's presentation is referenced in the Sustainability Report because its findings contributed to the ferry electrification becoming a priority capital improvement project for the airport.

The BQNA representative indicated that their point is that qualitative data reported by the community, including CLC member presentations are not included in the Sustainability Reports.

Ms. Wilson shared that a line was added to the 2021 Sustainability Report, based on the BQNA representative's feedback on the previous report, noting that communities in close proximity of the airport have been and continue to be concerned with the Air Quality impacts from airport operations.

Mr. David then explained that the term emissions has been used interchangeably. He noted that the term emissions is used to describe Scope 1, 2, and 3 GHG emissions which are calculations of how a certain volume of fossil fuels being burned will contribute to global carbon dioxide emissions. While in the Toronto Public Health study, the term emissions is used with respect to a direct measurement of emissions taken at local points.

Ms. Wilson then noted that the current version of the document detailing responses to comments will be shared with CLC members after this meeting, and that any additions based on this meeting's discussion would be included in a final version that will be circulated later.

Ms. Wilson noted that CLC members are welcome to share any additional feedback or requests for clarification on the Sustainability Report by email or at the next CLC meeting.

5. CLC Refresh

Alexander Furneaux (LURA Consulting) provided a presentation on the BBTCA CLC Refresh. Mr. Furneaux's presentation on the CLC Refresh is included in **Appendix D**.

Key points from Mr. Furneaux's update on this topic include the following:

- The CLC has been operating since February 2011. The CLC's mandate is to allow BBTCA stakeholders to communicate their perspectives and observations on airport development, operations, and activities, and represent the interests of their broader community. It also enables airport management to communicate proposals, planning issues, and relevant information to the community.
- The CLC Terms of Reference (TOR) was first approved on October 19th, 2010 and was last amended on May 15th, 2015.

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

- The CLC TOR notes that the composition of the CLC includes a Chairperson (PortsToronto – BBTCA Executive Vice President or designate) and 19 volunteer members that are generally representative of the waterfront community. The TOR also stipulates that CLC members serve a two-year term and that members may be reappointed for two additional terms for a membership duration of up to six years total.
- The CLC Refresh is being proposed to update the TOR with community input, fill long-standing vacant positions, invite new voices from existing representative organizations, broaden stakeholder representation to align with Toronto's growing waterfront, and advance diversity and inclusion within the CLC.
- The CLC Refresh proposes the following membership changes based on current vacancies and time served on the committee:
 - New representatives from YQNA, BQNA, and TICA, PortsToronto, and City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat.
 - Jessica Pellerin will replace Deborah Wilson as the new PortsToronto Communications representative.
 - Meg St John will replace Bryan Bowen as the new City of Toronto – Waterfront Secretariat representative.
 - Fill vacant positions to include representatives for the Community-at-Large, a waterfront hotel, Toronto District School Board (TDSB), and the new Ward 10 Councillor and staff.
 - Search for new representatives for Toronto Passenger Vessel Association (TPVA), and Waterfront Toronto.
 - Search for potential new members (subject to interest) such as the East Waterfront Neighbourhood Association, Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation, and other organizations based on input from the existing CLC membership.
- In June/July 2022, existing CLC members will be invited to participate in voluntary one-on-one meetings with a senior LURA facilitator to provide feedback on the CLC process, composition, and opportunity for improvements. Search for new members will also begin at this time.
- During Summer 2022, the new members will be selected, and the TOR will be revised.
- Tentatively the September CLC meeting will be a crossover meeting that includes both existing and new members; the new TOR will be reviewed during this meeting.
- Tentatively the November CLC meeting will be attended by the new CLC members; the new TOR will be confirmed at this meeting.

Mr. Furneaux then opened the floor up for any questions from CLC members.

The BQNA representative expressed that they are happy to hear that there will be a CLC refresh and indicated that they think it is a great idea. The BQNA representative asked how existing members can make recommendations on new members to add to the CLC.

Mr. Furneaux responded that existing members can email recommendations to him. Mr. Furneaux also noted that recommendations for new members would be one of the topics discussed during the voluntary one-on-one meetings with a LURA facilitator.

Mr. Furneaux noted that in addition to meeting with existing CLC members, LURA's intention for the one-on-one conversations would be to also meet with the Chairpersons of community associations where the Chairpersons are not members of the CLC already (as is the case for YQNA and TICA). Mr. Furneaux indicated that meeting with the Chairpersons of the community associations would provide valuable insights to the CLC Refresh process.

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

The YQNA representative indicated that every year YQNA members ask him if it is worthwhile for YQNA to participate in the CLC. The YQNA representative noted that his answer is always yes because he believes it is productive for YQNA to have regular conversations with BBTCA as part of this committee.

The YQNA representative noted that the YQNA had previously considered making a request to PortsToronto to allow two or three representatives from each neighborhood association to sit on the CLC, because it is difficult for one person to effectively keep track of all the issues related to the airport.

The YQNA representative then expressed concern that TICA has not regularly attended CLC meetings and indicated that there should be some discussion with TICA regarding this.

The YQNA representative added that a lot of organizations may be hesitant to send a representative to every meeting if the representative is being paid to attend. He indicated that organizations may only want to send a representative for one meeting each year. The YQNA representative suggested that meetings can be themed around topics that are relevant to a subset of members, so that members do not need to attend every meeting.

The YQNA representative asked whether Jim Faught (Director Emeritus at LURA Consulting) has been consulted on the CLC Refresh strategy.

Mr. Furneaux confirmed that Mr. Faught was consulted in the development of the CLC Refresh strategy, so that lessons from previous efforts at engaging CLC members can be incorporated. Mr. Furneaux indicated that Mr. Faught will continue to provide advice as the CLC Refresh progresses in an advisory capacity as needed.

The YQNA representative indicated that from their experience working with neighbourhood associations, it is extremely hard to attract people to volunteer for the community. The YQNA representative noted that those who do volunteer tend to be in their teens and twenties or they tend to be seniors that are retired.

The YQNA representative indicated that middle-aged professionals that have careers and families are hard to retain in a volunteer role for more than a couple years. The YQNA representative indicated that this is a problem because continuity of members is critical to the CLC running smoothly, so that topics do not have to be constantly repeated.

The Waterfront Business Improvement Area (Waterfront BIA) representative noted that 60% of residents on the waterfront are between the ages of 20 and 39. The Waterfront BIA indicated that they would like to see someone from this demographic represented on the CLC.

The Waterfront BIA representative noted that in addition to Waterfront BIA representing the interests of local businesses on the CLC, it would be helpful to have a business owner represented on the CLC.

Mr. Cabral indicated that the CLC Refresh should review the attendance of existing members and should reconsider the membership of organizations with poor attendance to make space for other organizations.

The YQNA representative noted that the timing of meetings should also be considered during the CLC Refresh. The YQNA representative indicated that some members may prefer meeting at a different time, such as during the day, and that this may contribute the member absenteeism.

Mr. Furneaux reiterated that additional feedback on the CLC Refresh can be provided during the one-on-one conversations with a senior LURA facilitator. Mr. Furneaux noted that he will be reaching out to each CLC member individually to schedule a time for the one-on-one meeting.

The YQNA representative inquired whether the meetings can include both the Chairperson and the representative from a neighbourhood association.

Mr. Furneaux confirmed that the intention for the meetings is to have both the Chairperson and the representative(s) from the neighbourhood associations to be present. Mr. Furneaux noted that LURA would look

to the representatives of each neighbourhood association to help coordinate scheduling with their association's Chairperson.

6. Community Updates

The BQNA representative noted that City Council has approved the proposal from Canderel for a [mixed-use development](#) at 545 Lake Shore Boulevard West.

The YQNA representative noted that over the last two weeks he has been busy liaising with several YQNA community members on information shared by Transport Canada (during BBTCA Noise Management Sub-Committee Meeting #16) about the Noise Exposure Forecast (NEF) model. The YQNA representative indicated that their community is very interested in learning about anything that is related to planning the airport's slot capacity.

The BQNA representative indicated that during the month of May, their community has noticed an increase in the number of planes waiting on the airfield. The BQNA representative reviewed some photos taken by community members to demonstrate what the community had noticed. These photos are included in **Appendix E**.

The BQNA representative noted that on Sunday May 15th, there was an exceptional amount of noise coming from the airport that lasted all day. The BQNA representative added that on Friday May 20th, loud and constant noise from the airport was heard throughout the evening, which prevented the BQNA representative from being able to carry a conversation with their neighbour.

The BQNA representative asked for clarification on what has changed at the airport that has contributed to there being so many more planes idling and causing this constant noise.

The BQNA representative also indicated the BBTCA noise complaint form should be updated because it currently uses language that is too technical, and this confuses community members. The BQNA representative added that some community members have stopped filing noise complaint reports because the responses they received gave the impression that their complaints were not being taken seriously.

The BQNA representative added that during the last BQNA meeting held in April, a motion was passed requesting that BBTCA postpone the increase in airport slots that is planned to take place in July, until the issue of increased planes idling on the runway is mitigated.

The BQNA representative asked for clarification on what mitigation measures will be taken over the summer to address the noise issues reported by the community.

Mr. Furneaux noted that members from PortsToronto and Porter Airlines had already provided answers earlier in the meeting regarding the contributing factors and measures being taken to address the increased idling of aircrafts on the runway. Mr. Furneaux asked for clarification on what answers the BQNA member was looking for beyond the answers already provided.

The BQNA representative responded that the motion passed by the BQNA asks that there be no increase in airport slots until the noise studies underway are completed and the full noise impact on the community is understood. The BQNA representative indicated that this community motion can be forwarded to BBTCA.

Mr. Cabral responded clarifying that almost all the aircrafts seen in the photos shared by the BQNA representative are inbound flights that have landed and are waiting to get to a gate to be offloaded. Mr. Cabral agreed that the impact on the community is significant and noted that the impact on the customers onboard the aircrafts is also significant. Mr. Cabral expressed that this outcome is not what BBTCA expects as part of its

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

normal operations, and that there are many contributing factors that have already been discussed at the meeting.

Mr. Cabral noted that a lot of pre-work has been done to strive towards operating procedure where there are not be any airplanes waiting to park at gates due to the increase in slots. Mr. Cabral also noted that BBTCA has some of the shortest taxi time on the ground, compared to airports around the world, and indicated that the typical taxiing time at BBTCA for inbound aircrafts is three to seven minutes.

Michael Antle (PortsToronto) added that he has had several meetings with airport tenants and NAV Canada to discuss the delays and how parties can work together to increase efficiency and address the contributing factors. Mr. Antle noted that on the holiday weekend that just passed (May 21 – 23), there were no issues of aircrafts waiting on the airfield due to delays. Mr. Antle expressed his belief that this improvement is due to the parties working together to solve the issues. Mr. Antle affirmed that these issues do not represent the standard that BBTCA wants to uphold for the community or the passengers using the airport.

The BQNA representative indicated that there was significant noise during the evening of Friday May 20th, that they heard from 7pm and that continued for two hours afterwards. The BQNA representative expressed their sadness that this noise prevented them from being on their balcony that night. The BQNA representative indicated that they captured an audio recording of the noise from that evening that they will send to both Mr. Cabral and Mr. Antle. The BQNA representative indicated that if the issue is a staffing shortage, then there needs to be a meeting to work this out because the impact on the community is awful.

Mr. Antle responded that he has convened meetings to discuss and address staffing challenges, but he was not able to find a meeting time that worked for all parties until 4:30pm on Friday May 20th.

The BQNA representative acknowledged that this meeting on Friday may have contributed to the improvements over the weekend.

The BQNA representative then indicated that they would like to work with Mr. MacWilliam to improve the noise complaint forms, so that they are less complex.

Mr. MacWilliam confirmed that he could work on improving the noise complaint forms with the BQNA representative.

M#46-A8 Mr. MacWilliam to work with the BQNA representative on improving the community noise complaint forms.

The BQNA representative confirmed that they would forward to PortsToronto the BQNA motion and audio recording that they referenced.

M#46-A9 BQNA representative to send PortsToronto a copy of the BQNA motion requesting postponement of planned slot increase, and an audio recording of noise heard on May 20th.

The YQNA representative indicated that the noise impact on May 20th from 7pm to 9pm that disrupted the BQNA representative would have been measured by the microphones on top of the ferry terminal building. The YQNA representative inquired whether the CLC could receive a summary of this noise data.

Mr. MacWilliam confirmed that he would work on obtaining this data.

M#46-A10 Mr. MacWilliam to provide a summary of noise data that was captured by the ferry terminal building noise monitor on May 20th from 7pm to 9pm.

7. Air Quality Study Update

Angela Homewood (PortsToronto) and the BQNA representative provided an update on the Air Quality Study. Ms. Homewood shared that the last meeting for the Air Quality Study's Communications Sub-Committee was held on May 5th, and that there is an upcoming meeting on June 9th. Ms. Homewood noted that the group is trying to reengage the City of Toronto and Toronto Public Health to be involved with the study now that activities related to the COVID-19 pandemic response are subsiding. Ms. Homewood also noted that the air monitoring sampling being conducted by the University of Toronto researchers is ongoing. Ms. Homewood indicated that she is looking to identify additional locations for air monitors that are publicly accessible, to supplement the one that will be on top of the passenger ferry terminal.

The BQNA representative noted that they had met with community members to identify what buildings could be available to have air monitors installed. The BQNA representative indicated that Windward Co-op, the National Yacht Club, and the Fort York Public Library may have air monitors installed, and that the study is still looking to install a fixed monitor that is closer to the Gardiner Expressway and Lakeshore Boulevard. The BQNA representative added that there is a blue car with air quality measuring equipment fixed on top of its roof that is being driven along the waterfront to gather air quality data, and that this activity would happen for about four weeks.

The BQNA representative also noted that about five balcony monitors have been dropped off at residential properties – one at the townhouses on 28 Stadium Road, one at 679 Queens Quay West, one at Arcadia Coop, and two at King's Landing (460 Queens Quay West).

The BQNA representative then asked whether Ms. St John would be attending the June 9th Air Quality Study meeting.

Ms. St John confirmed that they will be replacing Bryan Bowen as the representative for the Waterfront Secretariat and would be attending the June 9th meeting. Ms. St John indicated that Mr. Bowen could provide a briefing to her on the Air Quality Study in advance of the meeting.

The BQNA representative noted that they would send Ms. St John some background and onboarding documents, including the project team's Terms of Reference.

M#46-A11 The BQNA representative to provide Meg St John with onboarding materials for joining the Air Quality Study project team.

The YQNA representative then asked whether there is a map that shows the location of the air monitors being placed on residential buildings. The YQNA representative noted that they are trying to understand the rationale for some of the locations and having a map would be helpful.

The BQNA representative confirmed that they could provide the BQNA representative with a map of the locations. The BQNA representative indicated that the residential buildings were selected to include buildings close to the airport and buildings that are closer to the roadway.

Mr. Furneaux asked if links to any additional publicly available information on the placement of air monitors could be shared with CLC members.

Ms. Homewood noted that they could ask the University of Toronto researchers to post an update on the project website that includes this information.

M#46-A12 Ms. Homewood to request Air Quality Study researchers to post an update on project website regarding air monitors on residential buildings.

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

The BQNA representative noted there was a meeting summary created for the Air Quality Study public meeting held in January, and asked if this was shared with the CLC.

Mr. Furneaux noted that he would check if it was included as a link in the CLC #45 meeting minutes, and confirmed that he would add the link if it wasn't already there.

M#46-A13 Mr. Furneaux to confirm that a link to the meeting summary for the Air Quality Study public meeting held on January 27th is included in the CLC #45 meeting minutes.

The YQNA representative asked that in addition to the rationale for the air monitor locations, if an overview of the goals of the study can be included in the project update.

The BQNA representative confirmed that this information is available in a summary document about the study that can be shared.

Mr. Furneaux asked if this document could be sent to him to be included as part of a package of supplementary material from this meeting that he would share with CLC members.

The BQNA representative confirmed that they would share documents regarding Air Quality Study updates with Mr. Furneaux.

M#46-A14 Mr. Furneaux to distribute documents regarding Air Quality Study updates and project background information to CLC members.

8. Noise Management Sub-Committee Update

Angela Homewood (PortsToronto) provided an update on the Noise Management Sub-Committee (NMSC). Ms. Homewood noted that the NMSC is a sub-committee of the CLC, and that its mandate is to learn about noise management principles and discuss issues brought forward by the community regarding noise from airport operations.

Ms. Homewood noted that the latest NMSC Year-In-Review has been finalized and will be shared with the CLC – this summary can be found in **Appendix F**. She indicated the Year-In-Review provides an overview of NMSC activities, including the Ground Noise Study; the installation of additional permanent noise monitors at Windward Coop and Ontario Place; and research and consultations with subject matter experts to improve noise literacy.

Ms. Homewood noted that Transport Canada attended NMSC Meeting #16 to present on the NEF model. Ms. Homewood added that the NMSC has requested some follow-up information from Transport Canada, including a Practitioner's Guide on using the NEF model.

Ms. Homewood noted that the NMSC met three times in 2020 and three times in 2021. She indicated that the NMSC intends to meet four times in 2022.

9. Business Arising

Mr. Furneaux reminded members that the next CLC meeting is scheduled for September 28th and noted that the possibility of an in-person meeting would be assessed closer to the date.

The YQNA representative inquired whether a hybrid meeting format would be possible for CLC meetings moving forward. The YQNA representative noted that a hybrid meeting format may enable more members to attend meetings by retaining the option to join virtually.

Mr. Furneaux agreed that a hybrid meeting format would be ideal going forward but indicated that this would require technical requirements to be worked out so that all members can be heard well and can participate

PortsToronto BBTCA CLC
Meeting #46 – May 24, 2022

equally. Mr. Furneaux confirmed that LURA Consulting and PortsToronto would work together to determine how hybrid meetings can take place.

Mr. Furneaux then thanked the CLC members for the good discussion this meeting.

The meeting adjourned at approximately 8:45 p.m.